

A Service of the Thomas-Institut, Köln

Introduction

Biography of Averroes

Averrois Opera

Commentaries on Averroes

Editions and Translations

Bibliography of Scholarly Literature

The Medieval Translators

Sources & Abbreviations

This Page as PDF-File

Averroes Latinus Edition

Averroes-Database

[28]

Questions in Physics

General remarks:

The treatises we have collected under a common heading appear in the Arabic bio-bibliographies as seperate texts. It is only in the Hebrew tradition that we find some of them assembled, accompanied by a commentary by Mošeh Narboni. They are given there the title *Sefer ha-derušim ha-ṭib῾iyim* that is "Book on Physical Questions".
The chapters of the work known in Latin as *De substantia orbis* were originally single treatises. In as much as there are other treatises on the same subject, which are not included in the collection *De substania orbis*, we list all of these essays here (cf. also the remark below), while the Latin tradition is treated again seperately under : [20] De substantia orbis.
Most of the treatises mentioned are preserved only in Hebrew translation. One is known only in Latin, while others have been translated to Latin by Abraham de Balmes but were never printed. For the identification of the extant texts cf. the individual sections below.
The [57] Chapter on Temperament, *Maqāla fī l-mizāğ*, counted by G. Endress among the *Questions in Physics*, we list under the medical treatises, inasmuch as it is a refutation of Galen.
The seventeenth question mentioned by Rosenberg corresponds to [61] Ḍamīma; the eleventh is identical with [36] Chapter on intellect.

Cf. E § 41; HÜb § 91.

Manuscripts

a) arab.:
Madrid, Escurial, Ms. 632, ff. 76v-87v

b) hebr.:
(1) Berlin, Staatsbibliothek, Or. 2° 1057 <112> (IMHM 1835)
(2) Budapest, Oriental Collections of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Kaufmann Collection 285 (IMHM 14714)
(3) Petersburg, Firkowitsch I, 432-433 (IMHM 34096)
(4) Leipzig, Universitätsbibliothek, B.H.14<40> (IMHM 30745)
(5) London, British Museum, Add. 27559 <890> (IMHM 6094)
(6) München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, hebr. 31 (IMHM 1165)
(7) München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, hebr. 36 (IMHM 1166)
(8) New York, Jewish Theological Seminary, Mic. 2311 (IMHM 28564)
(9) Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Ms. héb. 918 (IMHM 31960)
(10) Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Ms. héb. 957 (IMHM 32607)

(11) Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Ms. héb. 988 (IMHM 30346)
(12) Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Ms. héb. 989 (IMHM 33990)
(13) Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Ms. héb. 1023 (IMHM 15717)
(14) Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Ms. héb. 1341 (IMHM 15639)
(15) Roma, Bibliotheca Apostolica Vaticana, Urbin. 41 (IMHM 680)
(16) Turin, A.V.18<138> [burned]
(17) Harvard, Houghton Library, Ms. Heb. 42
(18) Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Ms. héb. 945

c) lat.:
Alfonso Dinis and Abner of Burgos (?):
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Digbeianus 236, ff. 190r-194v

Abraham de Balmes:
Roma, Bibliotheca Apostolica Vaticana, Vat. ottob. lat. 2060

Michael Scotus (?):
Manuscripts of *De substania orbis*

Literature:

• Rosenberg, Shalom. "Ha-tirgumim ha-ʿibriyim la-'derušim ha-ṭibʿiyim' šel Ibn Rušd u-ferušo šel R. Mošeh Narboni". *Kiryat Sefer* 57 (1982): 715-724.

• Hyman, Arthur. "The Composition and Transmission of Averroes' Ma'amar be-ʿeṣem ha-galgal". In: *Studies and Essays in Honor of Abraham A. Neuman*. Philadelphia, 1963. 299-307.

• Tunik Goldstein, Helen. "New Hebrew Manuscript Sources for Averroean Texts". *Journal of Near Eastern Studies* 38 (1979): 29-31.

[28.1] Aristotle's intention at the beginning of book seven of the *Physics*

Title: The Arabic bio-bibliographies list no title corresponding to the contents of this treatise. As the extant Hebrew translation bears no title either we have chosen the first words as a provisional heading.

This is Question no. 1 in Steinschneider's count, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein.

Incipit: ...אמר בן רשד כוונת החכם בפתיחת המאמר השביעי

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(2)** ff. רו-רז ; **(4)** f. 186rv; **(6)** ff. 256r-257r; **(7)** ff. 219v-220v; **(11)** ff. 87v-88v; **(14)** ff. 66r-67r.

Editions:

b) hebr.:

• Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

• *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht [etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.2] Remark on the seventh and eighth book of the *Physics*

Title: Taʿlīq al-maqāla al-sābiʿa wa-l-ṯāmina min al-samāʿ al-ṭabīʿī

(B 68); The title in the Arabic manuscript reads: "Maqāla [...] ʿalā l-maqāla al-sābiʿa wa-l-ṯāmina min al-samāʿ al-ṭabīʿī li-ʾAriṣṭū". The Hebrew title in manuscript 14 is לז' ולח' מהשמע. This is Question no. 7 in Steinschneider's count, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein.

Incipit arab.: قال [...] ان الغرض في هذا القول ان نبين ان ما بينه ارسطو في أول المقاله السابعه من ان كل متحرك له محرك، وما بينه من ذلك أيضا في المقاله الثامنه، مطلوبان اثنان...

Incipit hebr.: הכוונה בזה המאמר שנבאר כי מה שבארו ארסטו' בתחלת המאמר השביעי בשכל מתנועע לו מניע ומה שבארו בזה ג"כ במאמר השמיני...

Manuscripts:

a) arab.:
Madrid, Escurial, Ms. 632, ff. 76v-85r

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(2)** ff. ריד-רכב ; **(6)** ff. 270r-283r; **(8)** ff. 19r-33v; **(14)** ff. 76v-83r; **(15)** ff. 101v-??

Editions:

a) arab.:

• -ʿAlawī, Ğamāl al-Dīn al-. "Masāʾil fī l-manṭiq wa-l-ṭabīʿīyāt li-ʾAbī l-Walīd Ibn Rušd". *Maǧallat kullīyat al-ʾādāb wa-l-ʿulūm al-ʾinsānīya bi-Fās* 2-3 (1979-1980): 271-375; 4-5 (1980-81): 321-432. {42}

• ʾAbū l-Walīd Ibn Rušd. *Maqālāt fī l-manṭiq wa-l-ʿilm al-ṭabīʿī*. Ed. Ğamāl al-Dīn al-ʿAlawī. Al-Dār al-Baiḍāʾ, 1983. {43}
  ○ Identical with the previous edition. This treatise is contained on pp. 225-243.

b) hebr.:

• Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

• *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht [etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.3] Treatise on movement, whether is has a beginning

Title: The Arabic bio-bibliographies list no title corresponding to the contents of this treatise. We have therefore chosen the title given to the extant Hebrew translation in manuscript no. 11 "Maʾamar ba-tenuʿah [...] ʾim lah hatḫalah".

This is Question no. 4 in Steinschneider's count, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein.

Incipit: אמר שהדרך אשר הלך בה אפלטון בחדוש התנועה שהוא אמר שכאשר תחויב בכאן תנועה לא היתה הנה...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(4)** ff. 187r-188r; **(2)** ff. רי-ריא ; **(6)** ff. 260r-261r; **(7)** f. 220rv; **(8)** ff. 4v-6r; **(11)** ff. 91v-92v; **(14)** f. 69rv; **(15)** ff. 91v-?.

Editions:

b) hebr.:

• Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

• *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht [etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.4] Chapter on eternal and temporal being

Title: Maqāla fī l-wuǧūd al-sarmadī wa-l-wuǧūd al-zamānī

(B 76). This descriptive title corresponds neatly to the contents of the Hebrew text, which bears in manuscript no. 14 the title *On time and movement*, "Ba-zeman u-ba-tenuʿah", referring to the two subjects mentioned in the first sentence. Other Arabic bibliographies (U 38; D 29) list a similar title, *Question on time*, "Masʾala fī l-zamān", which will thus supposedly designate the same text.

This is Question no. 5 in Steinschneider's count, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein.

Incipit: אמר בן רשד הזמן מליצה מהליכת מציאות הנמצאות

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(1)** ff. 4r-5v; **(4)** ff. 186v-187r; **(2)** ff. ריא-ריד ; **(6)** ff. 261r-263v; **(7)** ff. 219v-220r; **(8)** ff. 9r-11v; **(11)** ff. 95r-?; **(14)** ff. 71v-73r; **(15)** ff. 94v-?.

Editions:

b) hebr.:

- Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

- *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht [etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.5] Chapter on Seeds and Sperm

Title: Maqāla fī l-buzūr wa-l-zarʿ

(B 67). In the Arabic manuscript without title. The Hebrew title in manuscript no. 14 is *On sperms*, "Ba-zeraʿim".

This is Question no. 6 in Steinschneider's count, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein.

Incipit arab.: الغرض في هذا القول ان نفحص عن القوى الموجودة في البذور والزروع...

Incipit hebr.: אמר בייר כוונת זה המאמר היא שנחקור מכוחות הנמצאים בזרעים...

Manuscripts:

a) arab.:
Madrid, Escurial, Ms. 632, ff. 85r-87v

a) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(1)** ff. 5v-??; **(6)** ff. 263v-270r; **(8)** ff. 11v-19r; **(14)** ff. 73r-76v; **(15)** ff. 96r-101v.

Editions:

a) arab.:

- -ʿAlawī, Ğamāl al-Dīn al-. "Masāʾil fī l-manṭiq wa-l-ṭabīʿīyāt li-ʾAbī l-Walīd Ibn Rušd". *Maǧallat kullīyat al-ʾādāb wa-l-ʿulūm al-ʾinsānīya bi-Fās* 2-3 (1979-1980): 271-375; 4-5 (1980-81): 321-432. {42}

- ʾAbū l-Walīd Ibn Rušd. *Maqālāt fī l-manṭiq wa-l-ʿilm al-ṭabīʿī*. Ed. Ğamāl al-Dīn al-ʿAlawī. Al-Dār al-Baiḍāʾ, 1983. {43}
  - Identical with the previous edition. This treatise is contained on pp. 258-263.

b) hebr.:

- Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

- *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht [etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.6]

Will be updated later

Please notice

The following nine treatises, [28.7] to [28.15], which either came to be part of *De subtsantia orbis* or treat topics related to those who did, are presented in the order of those titles found in B which indicate treatises on the subject of the substance of heaven and its movement. The Barnāmağ is the only bibliography listing appropriate titles. But still, there are more extant treatises than titles. We have linked those titles there are with the texts they could have been referring to. As the subjects and consequently

the titles also are very close to one another, this is in some cases not much more than guesswork. The bibliographers have - or so it seems - often invented titles by taking up the first words of a treatise, so we took our lead from that.

[28.7] Chapter on the celestial body

Title: Maqāla fī l-ǧirm al-samawī

(B 48). This is the first chapter of the third treatise contained in the Hebrew collection "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal", it corresponds to the second chapter of *De subtsantia orbis*, entitled *De natura corporis coelestis, quopacto sit simplex, non compositum, non grave, neque leve: ac de pluribus ipsius accidentibus*. The identification of text and title was made on the basis of the underlined words in the Hebrew *incipit* that correspond exactely to the Arab title.

Incipit hebr.: הכונה בזה המאמר שנחקור בטבע הגרם השמימיי ומה ענין מאמרם בו שהוא פשוט...

Incipit lat.: Perscrutandum est igitur de natura corporis coelestis, et quid intelligunt, cum dicunt ipsum esse simplex...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above (folio-pages for the entirety of the "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal"): **(6)** ff. 287v-315r; **(8)** ff. 38r-70v; **(9)** ff. 166v-179v; **(10)** ff. 24v-42v; **(15)** 115r-136r.

c) lat.:
Manuscripts of *De substania orbis*

Editions:

b) hebr.:

- *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}
  - Reviews

c) lat.:

- *Averrois Cordubensis Sermo de substantia orbis, nuper castigatus, et duobus capitulis auctus* (*Aristotelis Opera cum Averrois Commentariis*, Venetiis: apud Junctas, 1562 [reprinted: Frankfurt a.M. 1962], Vol. IX, ff. 3r-14v). {0}
  - For Renaissance editions of the old Latin translation by Michael Scotus(?) see GW and Cranz: Padova: Laurentius Canozius, ca. 1474 (GW 2427); Venetiis: Philippus Petri, 1482 (GW 2336); Venetiis: Andreas Torresanus et Bartholemaeus de Blavis (ed. Nicoletus Vernia), 1483 (GW 2337); Venetiis:

Bernadinus Stagninus de Tridino, 1489 (GW 2339); Venetiis, 1505 (H); Frankfurt a.M., 1507 (H); Venetiis, 1514 (H); Lyon, 1529 (107.909). Ioannes de Ianduno, *In libris Aristotelis De Caelo et Mundo [...], quibus adiecimus Averrois sermonem de Substantia Orbis, cum eiusdem Ioanni commentario ac questionibus*. Venetiis: apud H. Scotus, 1552.
The revised edition with the additional two chapters translated by Abraham de Balmes is further contained in: Venetiis: apud Iuntas, 1550/52 (108.193); Venetiis: Iuntae, 1575 (108.599).
Of two more editions, mentioned by H, we could not determine whether they contain the old or the revised text: Venetiis, 1552; [s.l.], 1564.

• *Commentario al "De substantia orbis" por Alvaro de Toledo*. Lo edita y anota Manuel Alonso. Madrid, 1941. {75}
  ○ Contains the old translation by Michael Scotus(?), consisting of five chapters.

Translations:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}

[28.8] Another chapter on the celestial body

Title: Maqāla ʾuḫrā fī l-ǧirm al-samawī

(B 51). This is the second treatise contained in the Hebrew collection "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal", it corresponds to the fifth chapter of *De subtsantia orbis*, entitled *De coeli simplicitate ac spiritualitate*. In the Hebrew manuscript no. 9 this text bears the title *Treatise on the nature of the heavens*, "Maʾamar be-ṭebaʿ ha-šamayyim". Our identification of text and title was made on the basis of the underlined words in the Hebrew *incipit* that correspond to the Arab title.

Incipit hebr.: ...וכבר ראוי שנחקור ממאמרם בגשם השמימיי שהוא פשוט ושהוא רוחני

Incipit lat.: Perscrutandum est de hoc, quod dicunt, quod corpus coeleste est simplex, et spirituale...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above (folio-pages for the entirety of the "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal", except no. 1 and no. 7): **(1)** ff. 7v (this treatise only); **(6)** ff. 287v-315r; **(7)** ff. 220v-221v (this treatise and [28.12]); **(8)** ff. 38r-70v; **(9)** ff. 166v-179v; **(10)** ff. 24v-42v; **(15)** 115r-136r.

c) lat.:
Manuscripts of *De substania orbis*

Editions:

b) hebr.:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}
→ Reviews

c) lat.:

• *Averrois Cordubensis Sermo de substantia orbis, nuper castigatus, et duobus capitulis auctus* (*Aristotelis Opera cum Averrois Commentariis*, Venetiis: apud Junctas, 1562 [reprinted: Frankfurt a.M. 1962], Vol. IX, ff. 3r-14v). {0}
- For Renaissance editions of the old Latin translation by Michael Scotus(?) see GW and Cranz: Padova: Laurentius Canozius, ca. 1474 (GW 2427); Venetiis: Philippus Petri, 1482 (GW 2336); Venetiis: Andreas Torresanus et Bartholemaeus de Blavis (ed. Nicoletus Vernia), 1483 (GW 2337); Venetiis: Bernadinus Stagninus de Tridino, 1489 (GW 2339); Venetiis, 1505 (H); Frankfurt a.M., 1507 (H); Venetiis, 1514 (H); Lyon, 1529 (107.909). Ioannes de Ianduno, *In libris Aristotelis De Caelo et Mundo [...], quibus adiecimus Averrois sermonem de Substantia Orbis, cum eiusdem Ioanni commentario ac questionibus*. Venetiis: apud H. Scotus, 1552.
The revised edition with the additional two chapters translated by Abraham de Balmes is further contained in: Venetiis: apud Iuntas, 1550/52 (108.193); Venetiis: Iuntae, 1575 (108.599).
Of two more editions, mentioned by H, we could not determine whether they contain the old or the revised text: Venetiis, 1552; [s.l.], 1564.

• *Commentario al "De substantia orbis" por Alvaro de Toledo*. Lo edita y anota Manuel Alonso. Madrid, 1941. {75}
- Contains the old translation by Michael Scotus(?), consisting of five chapters. The present treatise, normally counted as fifth chapter, is presented in this edition as second part of the fourth (=[28.12]); it is contained on pp. 255-268.

Translations:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}

[28.9] Another chapter on this subject [*i.e.* the celestial body]

Title: Maqāla ʾuḫrā fīhi ʾaiḍan

(B 52). This is the second part of the third treatise contained in the Hebrew collection "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal", it corresponds to the treatise translated by Abraham de Balmes and added as a sixth chapter to *De subtsantia orbis*, entitled *Corpora coelestia non componi ex materia et forma*. Our identification of text and title was made on the basis of the content. Like the two preceding texts it deals with the nature of the celestial body.

Incipit hebr.: בני אדם מהמתפלספים ספקו בענין המניע, בשאמרו שהוא בלתי מחויב שיהיה בכאן מניע אינו בגשם כלל...

Incipit lat.: Viri philosophantes dubitaverunt de re motoris primi, quando dixerunt quod non sit necessarium quod sit hic motor, qui non sit in corpore omnino...

Date: Marrakesh, 574/1178-79

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above (folio-pages for the entirety of the "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal"): **(6)** ff. 287v-315r; **(8)** ff. 38r-70v; **(9)** ff. 166v-179v; **(10)** ff. 24v-42v; **(15)** 115r-136r.

Editions:

b) hebr.:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}
➔ Reviews

c) lat.:

• *Averrois Cordubensis Sermo de substantia orbis, nuper castigatus, et duobus capitulis auctus* (*Aristotelis Opera cum Averrois Commentariis*, Venetiis: apud Junctas, 1562 [reprinted: Frankfurt a.M. 1962], Vol. IX, ff. 3r-14v). {0}
○ The revised edition which includes this additional chapter translated by Abraham de Balmes is further contained in: Venetiis: apud Iuntas, 1550/52 (108.193); Venetiis: Iuntae, 1575 (108.599).
Of two more editions, mentioned by H, we could not determine whether they contain the old or the revised text: Venetiis, 1552; [s.l.], 1564.

Translations:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}

[28.10] Chapter on the substance of the sphere

Title: Maqāla fī ǧawhar al-falak

(B 64). This is the first treatise contained in the Hebrew collection "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal", the one which originally bore that title which was later extended to the whole collection. This title, meaning *Chapter on the substance of the sphere*, corresponds exactely to the Arabic one. This text also corresponds to the first chapter of *De subtsantia orbis*, entitled *De substantia coeli, eius quoque forma, ac materia.*

Incipit hebr.: ...הכונה בזה המאמר שנחקור מטבע הדברים אשר יורכב מהם הגרם השמימיי

Incipit lat.: In hoc tractatu intendimus perscrutari de rebus, ex quibus componitur corpus coeleste...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above (folio-pages for the entirety of the "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal"): **(6)** ff. 287v-315r; **(8)** ff. 38r-70v; **(9)** ff. 166v-179v; **(10)** ff. 24v-42v; **(15)** 115r-136r.

c) lat.:
Manuscripts of *De substania orbis*

Editions:

b) hebr.:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}
➔ Reviews

c) lat.:

• *Averrois Cordubensis Sermo de substantia orbis, nuper castigatus, et duobus capitulis auctus* (*Aristotelis Opera cum Averrois Commentariis*, Venetiis: apud Junctas, 1562 [reprinted: Frankfurt a.M. 1962], Vol. IX, ff. 3r-14v). {0}
○ For Renaissance editions of the old Latin translation by Michael Scotus(?) see GW and Cranz: Padova: Laurentius Canozius, ca. 1474 (GW 2427); Venetiis: Philippus Petri, 1482 (GW 2336); Venetiis: Andreas Torresanus et Bartholemaeus de Blavis (ed. Nicoletus Vernia), 1483 (GW 2337); Venetiis: Bernadinus Stagninus de Tridino, 1489 (GW 2339); Venetiis, 1505 (H); Frankfurt a.M., 1507 (H); Venetiis, 1514 (H); Lyon, 1529 (107.909). Ioannes de Ianduno, *In libris Aristotelis De Caelo et Mundo [...], quibus adiecimus Averrois sermonem de Substantia Orbis, cum eiusdem Ioanni commentario ac questionibus*. Venetiis: apud H. Scotus, 1552.
The revised edition with the additional two chapters translated by Abraham de Balmes is further contained in: Venetiis: apud Iuntas, 1550/52 (108.193); Venetiis: Iuntae, 1575 (108.599).
Of two more editions, mentioned by H, we could not determine whether they contain the old or the revised text: Venetiis, 1552; [s.l.], 1564.

• *Commentario al "De substantia orbis" por Alvaro de Toledo*. Lo edita y anota Manuel Alonso. Madrid, 1941. {75}
○ Contains the old translation by Michael Scotus(?), consisting of five chapters.

Translations:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}

[28.11] Discourse on a question from *De caelo et mundo*

Title: Kalām ʿalā masʾala min al-samāʾ wa-l-ʿālam

(B 66). This is the first part of the second chapter of the third treatise contained in the Hebrew collection "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal". It also corresponds to the third chapter of *De subtsantia orbis*, entitled *Formam coeli virtutem esse non in corpore: ipsumque simplex esse, non compositum: eiusque virtutem, in actione finitam, infinito, aeternoque tempore movere*. A second Hebrew translation of this text appears as an appendix in some of the manuscripts of Šelomoh Ibn ʿAyyub's translation of Averroes's Middle Commentary on *De caelo* (cf. Hyman, p. 304). Šelomoh introduces the treatise saying "In reply to the question mentioned at the end of the first treatise of this commentary the philosopher Averroes answers...". Given these facts we think that the above Arabic title most probably refers to this treatise.

Incipit hebr. (anonymous translation): למה שהתבאר מענין הגרמים השמיימים שהם מחוברים ממניע ומתנועע...

Incipit hebr. (ʿAyyub's translation): אחר שנתבאר מן הגשמים הרקיעיים שהם מחוברים ממניע ומתנועע...

Incipit lat.: Quia declaratum est corpora coelestia componi ex movente, et moto...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
Anonymous translation:
See the manuscripts listed above (folio-pages for the entirety of the "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal"): **(6)** ff. 287v-315r; **(8)** ff. 38r-70v; **(9)** ff. 166v-179v; **(10)** ff. 24v-42v; **(15)** 115r-136r.

ʿAyyub's translation:
(6) ff. 102v-105r; **(17)** ff. 258r-260v; **(18)** ff. 114v-117r.

c) lat.:
Manuscripts of *De substania orbis*

Editions:

b) hebr.:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}
➔ Reviews

c) lat.:

• *Averrois Cordubensis Sermo de substantia orbis, nuper castigatus, et duobus capitulis auctus* (*Aristotelis Opera cum Averrois Commentariis*, Venetiis: apud Junctas, 1562 [reprinted: Frankfurt

a.M. 1962], Vol. IX, ff. 3r-14v). {0}
- For Renaissance editions of the old Latin translation by Michael Scotus(?) see GW and Cranz: Padova: Laurentius Canozius, ca. 1474 (GW 2427); Venetiis: Philippus Petri, 1482 (GW 2336); Venetiis: Andreas Torresanus et Bartholemaeus de Blavis (ed. Nicoletus Vernia), 1483 (GW 2337); Venetiis: Bernadinus Stagninus de Tridino, 1489 (GW 2339); Venetiis, 1505 (H); Frankfurt a.M., 1507 (H); Venetiis, 1514 (H); Lyon, 1529 (107.909). Ioannes de Ianduno, *In libris Aristotelis De Caelo et Mundo [...], quibus adiecimus Averrois sermonem de Substantia Orbis, cum eiusdem Ioanni commentario ac questionibus*. Venetiis: apud H. Scotus, 1552.
The revised edition with the additional two chapters translated by Abraham de Balmes is further contained in: Venetiis: apud Iuntas, 1550/52 (108.193); Venetiis: Iuntae, 1575 (108.599).
Of two more editions, mentioned by H, we could not determine whether they contain the old or the revised text: Venetiis, 1552; [s.l.], 1564.

• *Commentario al "De substantia orbis" por Alvaro de Toledo*. Lo edita y anota Manuel Alonso. Madrid, 1941. {75}
- Contains the old translation by Michael Scotus(?), consisting of five chapters.

Translations:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}

[28.12] Discourse on the movement of the celestial body

Title: Kalām lahū ʿalā ḥarakat al-ǧirm al-samawī

(B 71). D 40, U 45: "Maqāla fī ḥarakat al-falak", that is *Chapter on the movement of the sphere*. This is the third chapter of the third treatise contained in the Hebrew collection "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal". It also corresponds to the fourth chapter of *De subtsantia orbis*, entitled *Quopacto necessaria sit motus coeli continuatio cum his inferioribus*. Our identification of text and title was made on the basis of the underlined words in the Hebrew *incipit* that are very close to those making up the Arab title

Incipit hebr.: ...החכם למה שהתבאר לו שתנועת השמים היא התנועה הראשונה

Incipit lat.: Cum declaratum est ab Aristotele quod motus celi est primus motus...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above (folio-pages for the entirety of the "Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal", except no. 7): **(6)** ff. 287v-315r; **(7)** ff. 220v-221v (this treatise and [28.8]); **(8)** ff. 38r-70v; **(9)** ff. 166v-179v; **(10)** ff. 24v-42v; **(15)** 115r-136r.

c) lat.:
Manuscripts of *De substania orbis*

Editions:

b) hebr.:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}
➔ Reviews

c) lat.:

• *Averrois Cordubensis Sermo de substantia orbis, nuper castigatus, et duobus capitulis auctus* (*Aristotelis Opera cum Averrois Commentariis*, Venetiis: apud Junctas, 1562 [reprinted: Frankfurt a.M. 1962], Vol. IX, ff. 3r-14v). {0}
○ For Renaissance editions of the old Latin translation by Michael Scotus(?) see GW and Cranz: Padova: Laurentius Canozius, ca. 1474 (GW 2427); Venetiis: Philippus Petri, 1482 (GW 2336); Venetiis: Andreas Torresanus et Bartholemaeus de Blavis (ed. Nicoletus Vernia), 1483 (GW 2337); Venetiis: Bernadinus Stagninus de Tridino, 1489 (GW 2339); Venetiis, 1505 (H); Frankfurt a.M., 1507 (H); Venetiis, 1514 (H); Lyon, 1529 (107.909). Ioannes de Ianduno, *In libris Aristotelis De Caelo et Mundo [...], quibus adiecimus Averrois sermonem de Substantia Orbis, cum eiusdem Ioanni commentario ac questionibus*. Venetiis: apud H. Scotus, 1552.
The revised edition with the additional two chapters translated by Abraham de Balmes is further contained in: Venetiis: apud Iuntas, 1550/52 (108.193); Venetiis: Iuntae, 1575 (108.599).
Of two more editions, mentioned by H, we could not determine whether they contain the old or the revised text: Venetiis, 1552; [s.l.], 1564.

• *Commentario al "De substantia orbis" por Alvaro de Toledo*. Lo edita y anota Manuel Alonso. Madrid, 1941. {75}
○ Contains the old translation by Michael Scotus(?), consisting of five chapters. The present treatise has been merged in this edition with what normally counts as fifth chapter (=[28.8]). Thus only the first part of chapter four, which is contained on pp. 243-254, corresponds to [28.12].

Translations:

• *Averroes' De Substantia orbis*. [Parallel title:] Maʾamar be-ʿeẓem ha-galgal le-Ibn Rušd be-targum ʿibri. Critical edition of the Hebrew text with English translation and commentary by Arthur Hyman. Cambridge (Mass.), Jerusalem, 1986. {74}

[28.13] Another discourse on this subject [*i.e.* the movement of the celestial body]

Title: Kalām ʾāḫar ʿalaihī ʾaiḍan

(B 72). We relate this title to the extant Hebrew treatise counted by Steinscheider as no. 8, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein. We made this identification because of the content, but treatise [28.15], thus resting

without transmitted title, would have been an equally probable candidate.

Incipit hebr.: אמר ב״ר שהחכם כאשר ביאר שהוא מחוייב שתהיה בכאן תנועה אחת נצחית מדובקת בסבוב...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(2)** ff. רכב-רלג ; **(6)** ff. 283r-286r; **(8)** ff. 33v-35v; **(14)** ff. 83r-84v.

Editions:

b) hebr.:

- Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

- *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht [etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.14] Discourse on the vision of the body which rests in circles

Title: Kalām lahū ʿalā ruʾyā al-ǧirm al-ṯābita bi-ʾadwār

(B 75). This slightly enigmatic title seems to correspond to a treatise extant in a Hebrew translation by Ṭodros Ṭodrosi, which later on was translated into Latin by Abraham de Balmes and added as seventh and final chapter to *De substantia orbis*, entitled *Quaesitum, quo ostendit, quando corpora coelestia, cum sint finita et possibilia ex se, acquirant ab alio aeternitatem*. It corresonds to Question no. 16 in Rosenberg's count. The Hebrew title, "Maʾamar le-Ibn Rušd horaʾah le-Ibn Sina ʿal mah šchiṣṣig ʿalav ba-maʾamar ha-qodem la-zeh", means: "A chapter by Averroes [offering] a proof for Avicenna regarding that same matter for which he criticized him in the preceding work". It refers to treatise [28.16], likewise translated by Ṭodros, which attacks Avicenna for teaching that something could become necessary without being such by itself. As proof for the identification with the Arabic title above we point to the mentioning in the *icipit* of the unceasing movement in circles and to the idea of "vision" expounded in the following passage (f. 14vG): "Ac etiam animae corporum coelestium non sunt aliquod ultra virtutes comprehendentes formas spirituales denudatas a materia, et quando intellectus scrutatus fuerit has virtutes, et denudaverit eas a formis spiritualibus, invenit eas de natura possibilis quando autem eas scrutatus esset secundum quod impossibile est ut denudentur a formis spiritualibus, inveniet eas de natura necessarii secundum aliud ab eis."

Incipit hebr.: אמר השופט התוריי אבן רשד יאר ה׳ פניו שלמה שיתבאר מענין הגרמהם השמימיים המתנועעים תנועת סבוב שתנועתם לא סרה ולא תסור...

Incipit lat.: Ex quo declaratum est de re corporum coelstium motorum motu circulari, quod eorum motus non defecerit, neque defecturus sit...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
Ṭodros ben Mešullam ben David Ṭodrosi (1340):
(5) ff. 307r-309v; **(12)** f. 29rv; **(13)** ff. 159v-162r.

Editions:

c) lat.:

- *Averrois Cordubensis Sermo de substantia orbis, nuper castigatus, et duobus capitulis auctus* (*Aristotelis Opera cum Averrois Commentariis*, Venetiis: apud Junctas, 1562 [reprinted: Frankfurt a.M. 1962], Vol. IX, ff. 3r-14v). {0}
  - The revised edition which includes this additional chapter translated by Abraham de Balmes is further contained in: Venetiis: apud Iuntas, 1550/52 (108.193); Venetiis: Iuntae, 1575 (108.599).
  Of two more editions, mentioned by H, we could not determine whether they contain the old or the revised text: Venetiis, 1552; [s.l.], 1564.

[28.15] On circular motion

Title: ?

The treatise on the motion of the celestial body, mentioned by B as no. 72, we did relate to [28.13], but it might equally well referr to this treatise, counted by Steinscheider as no. 2, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein.

Incipit hebr.: ...אמרתי ההקדמה האומרת שהתנועה הסבובית שלמה

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(2)** ff. רז-רח ; **(4)** f. 188rv; **(6)** f. 257rv; **(7)** f. 220 v; **(8)** ff. 1r-2r; **(11)** ff. 88v-89r; **(14)** f. 67rv; **(15)** f. 89rv.

Editions:

b) hebr.:

- Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

- *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht

[etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.16] Treatise in response to Avicenna's division of beings into the merely possible, the possible on account of itself but necessary on account of another, and the necessary on account of itself

Title: Maqāla fī l-radd ʿalā *ʾAbī ʿAlī* Ibn Sīnā fī taqsīmihī al-mauǧūdāt ʾilā mumkin ʿalā l-ʾiṭlāq wa-mumkin bi-ḏātihī *wāǧib bi-ġairihī wa-wāǧib bi-ḏātihī*

(U 40; D 36 ommits the italicized passages). This is Question no. 9 in Steinschneider's count, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein. The title in one of the two Hebrew translations, the one by Ṭodros Ṭodrosi namely, corresponds exactly to the Arabic one: "Maʾamar le-Ibn Rušd hassagah ʿal Ibn Sina be-ḫalleqo ha-nimẓaʾot ʾel ʾefšar be-ʿaẓmuto ve-ʾel ʾefšar be-ʿaẓmuto meḫuyaḇ be-zulato ve-ʾel meḫuyaḇ be-ʿaẓmuto".

Incipit hebr. (anonymous translation): אמר ב״ר א״ס סבור כי הנמצאות יתחלקו לשלשה חלקים...

Incipit hebr. (Ṭodros's translation): אמר אבן רשד אמר אבן סיני שהנמצאות יחלקו לשלשה חלקים...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
Anonymous translation: See the manuscripts listed above: **(2)** ff. רל-רלג ; **(6)** ff. 286 r-287v; **(8)** ff. 35v-38r; **(14)** ff. 84v-86r; **(15)** ff. 113v-115r

Ṭodros ben Mešullam ben David Ṭodrosi (1340):
(5) ff. 304r-307r; **(12)** ff. 28v-29r; **(13)** f. 159v.

Editions:

b) hebr.:

- Tunik Goldstein, Helen C. *Averroes, Questiones in Physica: Text, Translation and Notes*. Diss. Radcliffe University, 1956. {72}

Translations:

- *Averroes' questions in Physics: From the unpublished Sêfer ha-derûšîm ha-tibʿîyîm*. Translated and edited by Helen Tunik Goldstein (The New Synthese Historical Library 39). Dordrecht [etc.]: Kluwer, 1991. {73}

[28.17] Treatise on the prime mover

Title: Kalām lahū ʿalā l-muḥarrik al-ʾawwal

(B 70). The reported contents of this not preserved treatise make it probable that two titles, contained in other bibliographies, refer to the same text: *Book on the examination of questions raised by the metaphysical part of the Cure [al-Shifa'] by Avicenna*, that is: "Kitāb al-faḥṣ ʿan masāʾil waqaʿat fī l-ʾilāhīyāt min al-šifāʾ li-Ibn Sīnā" (D 28); "Kitāb fī l-faḥṣ ʿan masāʾil waqaʿat fī l-ʿilm al-ʾilāhī fī kitāb al-šifāʾ li-Ibn Sīnā" (U 37).

The general outline of the work has been reconstructed by H.A. Wolfson on the basis of a treatise by Mošeh ben Yosef al-Lawi, written as a refutation of Averroes's text and containing a general description, several paraphrases and quotations.

Literature:

• Wolfson, Harry Austryn. "Averroes' Lost Treatise on the Prime Mover". *Hebrew Union College Annual* 23, 1 (1950-51): 683-710. {76}
  ○ Reprinted in: *Studies in the History of Philosophy and Religion* 1. Ed. Isadore Twersky, George H. Williams. Cambridge, 1973. 402-429.

• Vajda, George. "Un champion de l'avicennisme. Le probl de l'identité de Dieu et du Premier Moteur d'àpres un opuscule judéo-arabe du XIII^{e} siècle". *Revue thomiste* (1948): 480-508.

[28.18] On the seperation of the first principle

Title: ?

This treatise, preserved only in Latin translation in a single manuscript bears the title *De separatione primi principii*. It deals with much the same questions as no. 17 without being identical with it.

Incipit lat.: Inquit alkaid, idest senscallus vel iudex, Abualualit Benrost quod qui inspexerunt in scientia secundum viam viatorum, idest peripateticorum...

Manuscripts:

c) lat.:
Alfonso Dinis and Abner of Burgos (?):
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Digbeianus 236, ff. 190r-194v

Editions:

c) lat.:

• Guldentops, Guy; Steel, Carlos. "An Unknown Treatise of Averroes against the Avicennians on the First Cause". *Recherches de théologie et de philosophie médiévales* 64 (1997): 86-135. {77}

[28.19] Chapter on the harmony between the belief of the peripatetics and that of the theologians among the learned of Islam regarding the manner of the worlds existence with respect to eternity and origination

Title: Maqāla fī l-ǧamʿ bain iʿtiqād al-mašāʾīn wa-l-mutakallimīn min ʾulamāʾ al-ʾislām [fī] kaifīya wuǧūd al-ʿālam fī qudūm wa-l-ḥudūṯ

(B 60-61). U 32; D 30: "Maqāla fī ʾanna mā yaʿtaqidūhu al-mašāʾūn wa-mā yaʿtaqidūhu al-mutakallimūn min ʾahl millatinā fī kaifīya wuǧūd al-ʿālam mutaqārib fī l-maʿnā. The Hebrew title in manuscript no. 14 is *On the manner of the worlds existence*, "Be-ʾek̲ut meziʾut ha-ʿolam".

This is Question no. 3 in Steinschneider's count, followed by Rosenberg and Tunik Goldstein.

Incipit hebr.: הכוונה בזה המאמר שנבאר שמה שהאמינוהו המשאיים ומה שהאמינוהו המדברים מאנשי מחוזינו באיכות מציאות העולם...

Manuscripts:

b) hebr.:
See the manuscripts listed above: **(2)** ff. רח-רי ; **(6)** ff. 257v-260r; **(8)** ff. 2r-4v; **(11)** ff. 89r-91v; **(14)** ff. 67v-69r; **(15)** ff. 89v-91v

Editions:

- Worms, Moses. *Die Lehre von der Anfangslosigkeit der Welt bei den mittelalterlichen arabischen Philosophen des Orients und ihre Bekämpfung durch die arabischen Theologen (Mutakallimūn)*. M?, 1900. {78}
  - This treatise is contained on pp. 63-70 with a German summary.

Translations:

- Kogan, Barry S. "Eternity and Origination: Averroes' Discourse on the Manner of the World's Existence". In: *Islamic Theology and Philosophy: Studies in Honor of George F. Hourani*. Ed. Michael E. Marmura. Albany, 1984. 203-235 and 308-318. {79}

[28.20] Treatise lifting the doubt of those contradicting the philosopher and his proof for the existence of prime matter and explaining that Aristotle's proof is obviously the truth

Title: Maqāla fī faṣḫ šubha man iʿtaraḍa ʿalā l-ḥakīm wa-burhānihī fī wuǧūd al-mādda al-ʾūlā wa-tabyīn ʾanna burhān ʾAriṣṭū huwa al-ḥaqq al-mubayyan

(U 39). D 35: "Maqāla fī wuǧū al-mādda al-ʾūlā".

Nothing further is known about this treatise.

Previous Averrois Opera Next

David Wirmer, Thomas-Institut, Cologne
Last updated: 07/24/2005